What works for young people’s development? A Case Study of BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescent Girls programme in Uganda and Tanzania

Nicola Banks ¹

January 2015
BWPI Working Paper 212

¹ The University of Manchester, UK
nicola.banks@manchester.ac.uk

ISBN: 978-1-909336-30-8

* This working paper contains revisions from the version posted in November 2014 and replaces the original version.

Brooks World Poverty Institute

www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk
Abstract

Young people constitute a large proportion of – and a particularly vulnerable segment of – Africa’s population. ‘Youth’ constitutes a critical stage in the life course, marked by decreasing household and familial support. Yet as we explore here in the context of Uganda and Tanzania, young Africans are poorly equipped for making the transition to work and financial independence. Consequently, they suffer disproportionately from Africa’s key social and economic development challenges. Alongside burgeoning youth populations this makes youth populations an increasingly pressing policy priority across the continent. This chapter explores how BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescent Girls programme (ELA) has been designed to respond to the social and economic challenges facing young women in Uganda and Tanzania. It highlights that the impact of integrated programmes can go beyond improved employment outcomes to improve social conditions and health outcomes for beneficiaries and their peers at the community level.

Keywords

youth, employment, sexual and reproductive health, Uganda, Tanzania

Author

Nicola Banks is an ESRC Future Research Leader at the Institute of Development Policy and Management, The University of Manchester. She was previously Head of BRAC Uganda’s Research and Evaluation Unit, managing BRAC’s research portfolio across Uganda, Tanzania and South Sudan. Contact for correspondence: Nicola.banks@manchester.ac.uk. This research was funded by the ESRC under grant reference number ES/K009729/1.
1. Background

Global youth unemployment has reached unprecedented levels. Latest figures highlight a 'Generation At Risk' from unemployment (ILO 2013). But labour market difficulties for young people go well beyond unemployment, with as many as two-thirds of youth populations in developing economies (where 90 percent of the global youth population live) being under-utilised (ILO 2013). Nowhere are these dangers more pronounced than in Sub-Saharan Africa, where youth constitute large proportions of national populations and where economic growth has been fuelled largely by natural resource extraction rather than industry, limiting the job-creating potential of growth in towns and cities (Kessides 2007; Potts 2013; World Bank 2014).

This paper highlights the need for explicit targeting of Africa’s young people in programmes for poverty reduction, on multiple grounds. Firstly, young people constitute large proportions of national populations. Young people (aged 15-29 years) constitute over 40% of the population in all but three African countries (Guenegent and May 2013), placing youth at the centre of Africa’s opportunities, challenges and crises (Burgess 2005; Lam 2006; Sippel et al 2011). The term ‘youth bulge’ has become synonymous with large youth populations in some policy circles, raising fears of large frustrated youth cohorts on national development outcomes. This sees young people – and particularly young men – as a threat to peace and stability as they try to demand greater access to resources or renegotiate the status quo (Sommers 2006; Urdal 2006).

Secondly, across the continent young people suffer disproportionately from its development challenges. Higher rates of under- and unemployment and HIV/AIDS infection, amongst others, are a stark illustration that it is young people who face the brunt of disadvantage in social, economic and political exclusion (Abbink 2005; Garrett 2005; Garcia and Fares 2008b; Burton 2010). Young people globally continue to be almost three times more likely than adults to be unemployed, increasing to up to four times in urban areas (Kondylis and Manacorda 2008; Garcia and Fares 2008b; ILO 2013). Certain groups of young people are at particular risk and disadvantage. This includes young women who experience relative material deprivation along multiple dimensions, poorer social, health and economic outcomes than young men and higher vulnerability to risk. They continue, for example, to be disproportionately affected by HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS 2013). Many young women are constrained by a self-reinforcing cycle of early school dropout, early pregnancy and motherhood, a high risk of exposure to STDS and HIV/AIDS, and subsequent difficulties accessing stable employment. Despite this, adolescent girls and young women continue to fall through the cracks of most development policies and programmes worldwide (Bangser 2010).

The third reason that warrants youth populations as deserving of specific programmatic attention is that youth is a critical period in the life-cycle. It is a period when young people become increasingly independent and household and familial support is reduced (Wuemli et al 2012; Juarez et al 2013). This places new responsibilities on young people, who need to survive today, plan for the future, and amidst a context of poverty and uncertainty – find resources that enable them to make a successful transition to adulthood. Employment and income-generation is critical in meeting these multiple needs. As well as its financial implications, long periods of under- and unemployment have devastating results throughout the life-cycle, reducing human capital accumulation and permanently impairing future job prospects (Mlatsheni and Rospabe 2002; Godfrey 2003; Garcia and Fares 2008).

1 Across Sub-Saharan Africa 3.1% of young women (aged 15-24) are living with HIV, in comparison with 1.3% of young men.

www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk
Box 1 illustrates the importance of employment to key transitions to adulthood that all young people must make.²

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 1. The importance of employment in the transition to adulthood</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As well as limiting human capital accumulation and constraining future employment opportunities, limited employment opportunities create obstacles for young people in other dimensions of the transition to adulthood:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition to family: Under- and unemployment leads to a significant fear of marriage, especially for young men, who must be able to provide for themselves before expanding financial responsibilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition to citizenship: Perceptions of adults and citizens are strongly associated with employment and marriage. Under- and unemployment leaves young people in a ‘transitional limbo’ (in which they are considered neither youth, nor adults) and reinforces negative stereotypes of youth in the community as ‘lazy’ or criminals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems with health: Low self-esteem, future uncertainty and limited perceived opportunities lead to limited or non-existent aspirations. These are risk factors that are linked with risky behaviours and negative sexual and reproductive health outcomes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Young people’s employment in Sub-Saharan Africa

Work is critical to income-generation, but also to securing status, acceptance and self-confidence (Bryceson 2010; World Bank 2014). Yet the labour market prospects of Africa’s youth populations are bleak. The informal sector remains the major source of job creation (Rodriguez-Pose and Timstra 2007; World Bank 2008), accounting for 90 percent of all new jobs created across Africa in the 1990s (Brown et al 2010). Shrinking formal labour markets and growing youth populations have increased pressure on labour markets, generating unprecedented levels of competition and creating new tensions along lines of generation, class and gender (Lindell 2010; Bryceson 2010). Africa’s youth unemployment rate of 11.8 percent is below the global average (of 12.6 percent) but is accompanied with a high dependence on irregular and informal opportunities and high levels of working poverty (ILO 2013; World Bank 2014). Nearly 70 percent of Sub-Saharan Africa’s young workers are under-utilised (Elder and Kone 2014). This represents a devastating threat to the productive potential of these countries, not to mention the individual price under- and unemployment places on the lives of Africa’s youth.

Despite the increasing agency that ‘youth-hood’ ascribes to young people, we see that limited job opportunities curtails this agency. Rather than a linear transition from school to work, then to marriage, family and citizenship, most young people face a situation of prolonged (if not indefinite) youth status with few opportunities for social and economic mobility (Valentine 2003; Jeffrey and McDowell 2004; Grant and Furstenberg Jr 2007; Worth 2009). The literature highlights the uncertainty, boredom and frustration that accompanies this transitional limbo across the continent (Hansen 2005; Grant 2006; Mains 2007; Ralph 2008; Jeffrey and Young 2012; Locke and Lintelo

² These transitions are based on the World Bank’s (2007) five transitions to adulthood, namely learning, work, health, family and citizenship. The transition to ‘learning’ is not included here as this generally precedes work in the transition to adulthood. Problems young people face in school retention and completion (or second-chance schooling for those who have dropped out) are another burning issue facing young people. They are beyond the scope of this current paper, however, so are not addressed here.
that leads to hopelessness and despair, severely curtailing hopes and aspirations and feeding into risky behaviours. There are also the devastating repercussions that ‘waiting’ youth populations are associated with consumption and dependence rather than accumulation. The subsequent stigmatisation of young people as ‘loiterers’ and ‘criminals’ place an additional obstacle in their ability to achieve social recognition as adults (Ralph 2008; Langevang and Gough 2009; Jeffrey and Young 2012).³

Youth employment is, therefore, an increasingly pressing policy priority across the continent, requiring action from governments, the private sector, NGOs, communities and young people themselves. In June 2012, representatives of governments, employers’ organisations and trade unions from the ILO’s 185 member states strategized on how to resolve the growing global youth employment crisis, adopting the ‘Youth Employment Crisis: A Call for Action’ resolution. This resolution highlighted five main policy areas including i) policies to increase aggregate demand and improve access to finance ii) education and training to ease the school-to-work transition and prevent skills mismatches iii) labour market policies to target employment of disadvantaged youth iv) entrepreneurship and self-employment and v) labour rights that ensure young people receive equal treatment (ILO 2013).⁴ This represents a two-fold approach, incorporating policies that promote stronger employment growth and those that ensure that the most disadvantaged young people acquire the literacy, numeracy and skills they need for better integration into local labour markets (Godfrey 2003; Garcia and Fares 2008b; ILO 2013; World Bank 2014). Policies to increase labour demand are influenced by the structure of the economy and shaped by state policies and regulation. Yet without building the skills and capabilities of young people, policies to expand job creation will not necessarily translate into better employment outcomes for them (Garcia and Fares 2008b). Here we explore how BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescents (ELA) programme in Uganda and Tanzania has been designed to improve employment outcomes among young women at the same time as addressing their broader social development.

The following section introduces the context in which ELA operates, looking at the key social and economic challenges facing young people – and young women in particular – in Uganda and Tanzania. Section 4 then traces how the programme has been designed to address these vulnerabilities. Findings from a first-round impact evaluation of the programme in Uganda find that alongside increasing labour force participation and incomes, the programme improves health-related knowledge, reduces risky behaviours and leads to better health outcomes (Bandiera et al 2012), and we explore the channels through which these outcomes are realised. Section 5 concludes with some lessons for other NGO programmes aimed at young people’s social and economic development.

3. Young people’s social and economic vulnerability in Uganda and Tanzania

In both countries, young people constitute large and increasing proportions of the population. Uganda had the world’s youngest population in 2010 and the highest prevalence of poverty among its youth (World Bank 2008; Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Latest census figures indicate that 78 percent of Uganda’s population is under the age of 30 (UBOS 2010). Likewise, with 66 percent of its population

³ Under- and unemployed young people are frequently perceived as criminals for the fact that they are surviving without regular work and income. The assumption is therefore made that they are providing for their basic needs through illegitimate means.

⁴ Several papers provide comprehensive overviews or inventories of different employment policies and programmes for youth employment across these dimensions. See for example, Godfrey 2003; Betcherman et al 2007; Blatvaschi et al 2012; ILO 2013; World Bank 2014.
under the age of 25, Tanzania is fast approaching a ‘youth bulge’ that is expected to last for at least 30 years (Restless Development 2013).

Young people suffer disproportionately from deteriorating labour market outcomes in both countries. Tanzania has the highest average youth unemployment rate of 42 percent, well above Sub-Saharan Africa’s average rate of 22.8 percent (Elder and Kone 2014). Joblessness in Tanzania is largely due to a lack of sufficient aggregate demand for labour relative to aggregate supply – a problem that is particularly acute for young adults, and even more so for urban youth (Bridges et al 2005; Kondylis and Manacorda 2008; Garcia and Fares 2008; Restless Development 2013). Long-term is a serious problem: more than 40 percent of unemployed young adults in Tanzania have been unemployed for more than two years, and more than 70 percent have been unemployed for more than a year (Garcia and Fares 2008). Partly a result of this, one quarter and 67 percent of young men and women, respectively, are ‘discouraged workers’ – inactive members of the labour force who have been discouraged from their job search (Godfrey 2003).

Young people make up 80 percent of Uganda’s unemployed (IYF 2011), taking an average of three years before finding employment (Garcia and Fares 2008c). Over 90 percent of Ugandan youth (aged 15-24) survive through irregular and informal employment (Garcia and Fares 2008) and one in three Ugandan youth do not have sufficient work (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Only 12 percent of Ugandan youth receive stable monthly incomes, highlighting the difficulties they face meeting their basic needs. As young men in Kampala highlighted, “We are always seen in one place, staying with our parents and putting on the same clothes. So in the end, we are considered dependent even when we work, and people don’t respect us” (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Urban youth, as in Tanzania, experience particularly difficult labour markets (IYF 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Young women too face disproportionate disadvantage in the labour market: 27 percent of young women were unemployed in 2009 in comparison with nine percent of young men (IYF 2011).

We must consider the broader social implications of youth under- and unemployment, including negative stereotypes of young people and a lack of institutional support for youth. Together these reinforce the exclusion of young people and create structural obstacles to their participation in the household, community and broader society (Burgess 2005; Hansen 2005; World Bank 2007; Jeffrey 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2012). They also lead to considerable stress, vulnerability and anxiety among young people, leading to risky health-related behaviours that can result in alcohol and drug use, early pregnancy and the transmission of sexually-transmitted diseases and HIV/AIDS. Research in Uganda confirms that under- and unemployment is a major determinant of peer pressure to have sexual intercourse. Under- and unemployed youth are 10 percentage points more likely to experience peer pressure to have sex, and these effects are also evident at the community-level. A greater proportion of young people feel peer pressure to have sexual intercourse in communities with higher rates of under- and unemployed youth (Banks and Sulaiman 2012).

Concerns about young people’s health-related behaviours and their long-term implications on well-being and mortality are frequently expressed (Furlong 2009). Research into transactional sexual relationships make a strong link between poverty, risky sexual behaviours and disproportionate

---

5 Rural youth face much less problem accessing employment given the ability of the agriculture sector to absorb new labour market entrants (Garcia and Fares 2008). 96.8 percent of prime-age rural men are employed versus 92.2 percent of rural young men. Only a small percentage of the urban unemployed can be attributed to young people being in education. If we look at figures for young men not at work or in education this constitutes 17.1 6 percentage of urban young men, increasing to 40.7 percent in Dar es Salaam (Kondylis and Manacorda 2008). These figures are based on an analysis of Tanzania’s Integrated Labour Force Survey (2000-01).
exposure to HIV/AIDS and sexually-transmitted diseases among young women in Sub-Saharan Africa (Hulton et al 2000; Luke 2005; Gillespie et al 2007; Santis et al 2007; Mugisha 2009; Stephenson 2009). Transactional sexual relationships are one route through which young women can meet their basic needs where income-generating opportunities are scarce. As young women in Uganda highlighted, “It is poverty at home that forces one to give into the demands of the opposite sex... A girl may decide to have sex with a man just to earn 5,000 shillings to buy essentials” (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Where poverty drives this decision, young women have limited control over negotiating condom usage, heightening their risk of early pregnancy and exposure to sexually-transmitted infections and HIV/AIDS (Luke 2003; Gillespie et al 2007; Samara 2010; Banks and Sulaiman 2012).

Their lower economic and socio-cultural status means that young women face marked gender inequalities. Child marriage and early pregnancy, poorer educational and employment outcomes and higher vulnerability to violence, abuse and exploitation are significant challenges significantly constrain the life chances of young women across the continent (Garcia and Fares 2008c; UNICEF 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2012; Elder and Kone 2014; World Bank 2014). Young women also spend a disproportionate time caring for other family members, engaged in domestic responsibilities or working as unpaid family labourers (Godfrey 2003). A nationally-representative survey in Uganda finds that young women receive, on average, 0.7 years less schooling than young men, are disadvantaged in ownership of physical assets and land, and have less access to finance (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). In Tanzania, too, there are marked discrepancies in educational outcomes by gender. Tanzanian young women are less likely to be in school than young men of the same age (Kondylis and Manacorda 2008) and literacy rates are 83 and 78 percent for young men and women (NBS 2010). That young women leave the household and familial responsibility on marriage contributes to the fact that parents invest less in young women and traditionally exclude them from inheritance rights. Early marriage and/or pregnancy also trigger early withdrawal from schooling. When girls fall pregnant they face an even bigger set of challenges that influence their ability to stay in school, achieve positive health outcomes and avoid social and economic threats (Bangser 2010). Not surprising then, that 30 percent of Ugandan youth identify early pregnancy as the biggest health risk for young women (Banks and Sulaiman 2012).

Young women are also particularly vulnerable to HIV/AIDS. In Tanzania, young women are at a higher risk of infection from an earlier age, accounting for 45 percent of new HIV/AIDS infections

---

6 There are, of course, other reasons for entering into transactional sexual relationships, which is a routine dimension of relationships and a means through which men show their respect for women and prove their ability to support their partner in a relationship. As well as those motivated by poverty, other may engage in these relationships to increase longer-term life chances (such as employment or school fees), to increase status in front of peers, or to receive luxury goods that they require (Moore et al 2007). Those driven by poverty and basic needs, however, enter into these relationships from the most vulnerable position.

7 As well as economic asymmetries, age asymmetries (entering into relationships with ‘Sugar Daddies’ or ‘Sugar Mummies’ also increase vulnerability in sexual relationships in terms of reduced power of negotiation in safer sexual activity (Luke 2005; Samara 2011; Nobelius et al 2011). Low and irregular incomes also influence the risky sexual behaviours for young men, albeit for different motivations. Unable to follow traditional paths to adulthood marked out by work and marriage, young men seek new means through which to assert their masculinity. One such avenue is through multiple sexual partners, a practice which increases the vulnerability of both partners in terms of exposure to sexually-transmitted diseases and HIV/AIDS (Unicef 2004; Plan International 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2013).

8 Both Uganda and Tanzania display significantly higher rates of HIV/AIDS infection than Africa’s average: 7.2% and 5.8% of their populations (aged 15-49) respectively are HIV positive, in comparison with 4.9% across Sub-Saharan Africa (PRB 2014).
Young women in Uganda, too, display a higher prevalence of HIV/AIDS than young men across all age ranges (MoH 2006). In both countries young women in urban areas are particularly at risk (MoH 2006; TACAIDS 2008). Young women are also exposed to staggering levels of physical, sexual and emotional violence. Nearly one in three girls in Tanzania have experienced sexual violence before the age of 18, with experiences of physical violence increasing to almost three-quarters of girls in this age group (UNICEF 2011b).

We see, therefore, that young women in East Africa grow up in a context of material poverty and social, physical and economic vulnerability, which combine to constrain hopes and aspirations and to fuel anxiety, mental stresses and engagement in risky behaviours. Effective programmes to improve young women’s social and economic opportunities, transform behaviours, and counteract their social and economic vulnerabilities require an in-depth understanding of the full range of these obstacles and vulnerabilities. As we will see, helping young people is not about ‘solving’ the problems associated with young people, but about effectively identifying the resources and support they need at different stages of their life cycle and improving their access to them.

Programmes for young women primarily focus on one of the two main ‘outcomes’ of their poverty and disadvantage, namely unemployment or risky health-related behaviours (and the associated high rates of early pregnancy and infection rates that accompany these) (Bandiera et al 2012). Some aim to improve sexual and reproductive health (SRH) knowledge through improving SRH education in school, extending knowledge through mass media campaigns, or through providing and promoting youth-friendly services. Others try to build the skills and capabilities young women need to help them into better employment, through vocational training, programmes to overcome skills mismatches and exclusion from job information networks or the formal credit market, or interventions that help young people into self-employment. However, as we have just seen, these two ‘problems’ (poor employment outcomes and risky health-related behaviours) are closely linked. Addressing them independently of one another, therefore, may treat symptom rather than cause, thereby failing to address the root causes underlying the problems.

We can illustrate this by looking at programmes designed to improve the SRH knowledge of young people. These identify limited SRH knowledge as the primary driver of risky health-related behaviours. By this logic, improvements in SRH knowledge will help young people make safer and more informed decisions, reducing these behaviours and bringing down high rates of early pregnancy and/or HIV/AIDS infection. This logical chain, however, does not consider the mismatch that exists between SRH knowledge and practices (Hulton et al 2000). In Tanzania, 40 and 47 percent of young women and men (aged 15-24) have “comprehensive” knowledge of HIV/AIDS, there is near universal knowledge of modern methods of contraception, and 65 and 85 percent of young women and men know where to source condoms (NBS 2010; TACAIDS 2013). Despite this, only 43 percent of unmarried sexually-active young women (aged 15 to 24) are using modern methods of contraception (NBS 2010). SRH knowledge is lower in Uganda, especially among young women. Around 30 and 36 percent of young women and men (aged 15 to 24) display “comprehensive” knowledge of HIV/AIDS, although a large proportion of both sexes know how it is transmitted and can reject common misconceptions about it (MoH 2006). Yet while around 70 percent of young men and women highlight

---

9 Young men constitute 26 percent of new HIV/AIDS infections (NBS 2010). Urban youth, too, display a higher prevalence of HIV/AIDS infection in both countries, especially for young women (TACAIDS 2008; MoH 2006).
10 2.6, 6.3 and 8.7 percent of young women in the age ranges of 15-19, 20-24 and 25-29 are HIV-positive, in comparison with rates of only 0.3, 2.4 and 5.9 percent of young men across the same age ranges (MoH 2006).

www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk
the importance of using condoms to reduce the likelihood of HIV/AIDS, only 27 percent of young women used a condom during their last sexual encounter (MoH 2006).

Improving sexual and reproductive health knowledge is critical, but is not enough on its own to change behaviours and outcomes, because it overlooks other drivers of risky behaviours, including poverty, a lack of economic opportunity and financial independence, and severe gender inequalities that give young women little power over the terms of sexual relationships. A deeper understanding of risky behaviours recognises that programmes focusing on improved health outcomes alone are poorly prepared to deal with their root causes. We have to see these behaviours and practices as outcomes of a much broader set of constraints and challenges facing young women (Hulton et al 2004; Munsch et al 2004; Karen et al 2009; Mabala 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Behavioural change within this context is therefore dependent on transforming opportunities for young women, giving them the economic power they require for implementing informed decisions. This is the philosophy that underpins the design of BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescents (ELA) programme. It recognises the inter-linkages between young women’s economic, social and health vulnerabilities and that programme impact can be maximised by pursuing social and economic objectives simultaneously.

4. BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescents Programme

BRAC is a Bangladeshi NGO that has received global acclaim for its work in poverty reduction and community development. In 2002 it expanded its operations internationally, beginning operations in Uganda and Tanzania in 2006. Recognising the multiple challenges of school dropout, early pregnancy, poverty and unemployment faced by young women in East Africa, the Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescents (ELA) programme was designed and implemented from 2008, with an initial 100 clubs opened in both Tanzania and Uganda (Yam 2013). The programme seeks the social and economic empowerment of young women (aged 13 to 25) through an integrated programme of life skills and livelihoods training and access to microfinance, delivered through a club-based platform that provides peer support and a place for music, dance, drama and sports to school-going and out-of-school young women. It joins a calibre of development programmes in trying to reverse the cycle of intergenerational poverty by putting girls first in attempts to overcome problems of early school dropouts, early marriage and motherhood, and long-term social and economic insecurity and in doing so, realising their potential role as important agents of change in the community.11 In partnership with the MasterCard Foundation, ELA has scaled up dramatically in Uganda, now reaching 1,285 clubs and around 50,000 girls across the country. In neighbouring Tanzania the programme has grown more slowly, with 180 clubs reaching around 7,400 girls (BRAC 2012a; 2012b).12 The programme and its components are broken down in Table 1 below.

---

11 See www.thegirleffect.org
12 This rapid expansion is matched across BRAC Uganda’s entire programme portfolio. Core funding support through a partnership with The MasterCard Foundation has helped turn the Uganda Office to become BRAC’s largest and fastest scale-up in the five African countries it operates (www.uganda.brac.net).
Table 1. BRAC’s Empowerment and Livelihoods for Adolescent Girls Programme: Components, purpose and timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme component</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Project timeline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Club House</td>
<td>To provide a safe space for learning, socialising and supporting one another, as well as an enabling environment that helps maximise returns to social and economic investments.</td>
<td>From club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentor</td>
<td>Appointed by community to facilitate club activities and act as role model to members.</td>
<td>From club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life skills training</td>
<td>To improve SRH knowledge and reduce risky behaviours, early pregnancy and transmission of STDs and HIV/AIDS.</td>
<td>From club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To improve life skills such as leadership, negotiation and improved knowledge on rights. Building confidence and solidarity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various activities (Sports, games, books, music, dance, drama)</td>
<td>To build confidence and solidarity and an opportunity for members to be ‘young’ amidst adult responsibilities.</td>
<td>From club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livelihoods skills training (and inputs)</td>
<td>To build skills that members can translate into income-generating opportunities. (For training in agriculture and poultry this is accompanied by inputs to increase skills utilisation)</td>
<td>Six months after club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial literacy training</td>
<td>To enhance financial literacy, maximise the impact of livelihood training, and prepare members for possibility of taking microfinance loans.</td>
<td>Seven months after club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microfinance</td>
<td>To provide start-up capital for self-employment. Loans start at the local equivalent of around US$100, increasing by around US$60 each cycle.</td>
<td>Eight months after club opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/support committees</td>
<td>To build a supportive environment for the club and help programme’s transformative objectives.</td>
<td>From club opening</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Compiled from BRAC documents, particularly Yam 2013)

Economic components include financial literacy training, vocational training and microfinance, while social components include the provision of a safe space for socialising, playing and learning, life skills training and mentoring. Recognising the importance of institutional support to young people’s acceptance and development in the community, BRAC also mobilises parent support committees. Individually each of these components plays an important role. Together, they work to create an enabling environment that protects investments gained as young women become equipped with skills, support, confidence and access to finance. Through this process, the programme aims to socially and
economically empower members in a way that improves their own lives and their dependents’ lives and ultimately allows them to, “become agents of change in their families and communities”. Findings from a recent impact evaluation in Uganda indicate that this goal is more than just a high-level dream. Alongside the economic improvement of individual club members, improvements in the form of health behaviours and outcomes showed a positive spill-over effect across young women in ELA communities (YEN 2013). Here we explore how Uganda’s programme has achieved these results, giving young women the economic power to make good decisions and in the process transforming social norms and practices in the community.

ELA’s Social Components

As Table 1 highlights, the ELA model follows a graduated approach, starting with the programme’s social components and building towards the introduction of livelihood and financial literacy training and microfinance. At the centre of the programme is the provision of adolescent development clubs, which offers a platform of service delivery that provides a safe physical space for programme activities and creates a supportive and enabling environment that helps fulfil the programme’s social, economic and transformative objectives. It is within these spaces that the social benefits of the programme are realised. Clubs are open every weekday afternoon and led by a female mentor, who is selected by the community as a responsible young woman with leadership potential (Yam 2013). Alongside a variety of club activities (which include reading, board games, sports, singing, drama and dancing), mentors facilitate a programme of life-skills based discussions. These cover; the key health-related risks issues that young women face (such as puberty, menstruation, family planning, sexually-transmitted infections and HIV/AIDS, sexual and reproductive health issues and rape); life skills such as management skills, negotiation, leadership and conflict resolution; and legal issues affecting women such as bride price, child marriage and violence against women (Bandiera et al 2012). Crucially, the club space enables privacy, critical in discussing these sensitive topics and in creating a space where young women feel comfortable sharing and discussing personal issues and problems.

There are two important processes at play here. One is the process of education itself – the transmission of relevant information about the issues and risks young women face in their day-to-day lives. Secondly, however – and perhaps more importantly to the programme’s transformative goals – is the creation of a strong peer support network. Research in both Uganda and Tanzania highlights the limited material and emotional support young people receive from their parents, making peer support one of their most valuable assets (Banks and Sulaiman 2012; Banks forthcoming). Creating a space where peer support can be nurtured aims to magnify this impact. Regular interactions allow club members to create strong networks that offer support and advice, providing opportunities to collectively discuss and solve problems that girls come across in their daily lives. One young woman in Uganda highlighted that of all the things the ELA club had contributed to her success, the most important was not the training or microfinance that had helped her start and expand a thriving business, but the support and guidance she had received from her ELA group. Through this support she no longer has to struggle to ‘go it alone’, and has a close-knit group of friends in similar positions with whom she discusses how best to survive and support their dependents, how best they can sustain their businesses, and how best to live well with others without conflict – including how to resist the advances of the opposite sex (Banks and Sulaiman 2012).

13 Mentors receive an intensive week-long training course before starting their position, then regular refresher meetings to help in their development. They receive a small monthly honorarium for their services, which are otherwise seen as voluntary (Yam 2013).
Differences across Uganda and Tanzania highlight two important aspects of these processes of change. One is the socio-cultural context which directly influences the effectiveness of the life-skills component in building a strong network of solidarity. In Uganda, the peer support platform is maximised because Ugandans are typically open and free in their discussions of personal and intimate lives: this leads to frank discussions in which members are happy to share their personal experiences (Yam 2013). In contrast, cultural characteristics dampen the impact of these activities in Tanzania, with members reluctant to discuss their private lives and personal experiences for fear of judgement (Yam 2013). Second is the importance of a physical space that allows ELA members to feel ownership and encourages regular attendance. This is apparent when we look at one region of Tanzania where the programme was facing implementation and retention problems. Here the programme had been unable to secure clubhouses in many of the villages, with meetings varying across different members’ houses or in open spaces around the town (Yam 2013). This caused multiple problems: if it rained clubs could not open, materials got lost and damaged moving around regularly, and girls got tired of moving from place to place (Yam 2013). In contrast, all ELA clubs in Uganda have their own prescribed space, enabling girls to take ownership over the space and decorate it with posters, paintings and drawings from their life-skills sessions (Yam 2013).

It is easy to underestimate the importance of the ‘social’ side of club activities. Time use allocations in Uganda highlight that large proportions of young people’s time are taken up by work, study, and domestic responsibilities, leaving little time for entertainment or escaping the responsibilities and pressures of everyday life (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Parents (or husbands) frown upon time that is not spent ‘productively’ away from household duties and obligations, but young people see these social activities as critical to developing their talents. Group participation assists with the development of a range of social competencies such as self-esteem, communication skills and confidence, and builds social assets through expanding friends and social networks, engaging with young people from other backgrounds and communities, and promoting positive perceptions of young people in the community (Scales et al 2001; Tanti et al 2011; Banks and Sulaiman 2012).

A diverse selection of activities is central to regular participation. Evaluation of Uganda’s ELA programme two years after its initiation revealed that the majority of members attended club meetings for an average of one or two times a week over this period, representing a significant time investment (Bandiera et al 2012). Retaining commitment to the programme, therefore, requires ongoing activities that members continue to find enjoyable and attractive. Again, comparisons across the Ugandan and Tanzanian programmes highlight this fact, with the quantity and quality of resources available to members varying across locations. In the struggling region of Tanzania, clubs lacked a variety of functioning materials to attract girls, which mentors blamed for low attendance rates in their clubs (Yam 2013). ELA clubs were running more successfully in a second region of Tanzania, but even here, where there was a better variety of books and games, members complained about the repetitiveness of activities, with girls growing bored of reading the same books and playing the same games so frequently (Yam 2013). The programme in Uganda has responded to these challenges by diversifying and improving club activities, holding regional sports, music and talent competitions across clubs, encouraging members to perform at community forums to share the life-skills training they have used, and developing their artistic talents through teaching handicraft production (Yam 2013).
ELA’s Economic Components

The programme’s economic dimension (aiming to increase employment and incomes) is one of the key attractions to club membership and central to generating parental and community support for the programme (Yam 2013). The programme generally attracts young women who place a high value on financial independence (such as single mothers or those alienated from their families) and those who are most likely to benefit from economic activities, namely those who believe they could be successful entrepreneurs but who lack the skills for this prior to joining (Bandiera et al 2009). Consequently, ELA’s economic components are not introduced until six months after club opening to ensure the full life-skills based education is completed first. In the sixth month, a range of livelihood training is made available, followed by financial literacy training in the seventh. The staggered introduction of these two aims to prepare members for the introduction of microfinance in the eighth month. This equips members with the skills they need to expand income-generating activities, financial know-how on how to manage small businesses and increased incomes, then finally the access to capital they need to fulfil this.

Members can self-select onto a variety of livelihood trainings. Beneficiaries of the training are primarily non-school-going members.14 BRAC agriculture staff teach short courses on agriculture, poultry and livestock-rearing,15 and local experts are hired to teach short introductory courses to activities that include hair-dressing, food-processing and tailoring. In both contexts, members, parents and trainers have voiced concerns about the livelihood training (Yam 2013). These primarily surround the fact that courses tend to be introductory: most take place in under a week, which is insufficient exposure to equip members with enough understanding of the skills they need to utilise them for income-generation (Yam 2013). Microfinance is introduced to ELA clubs after members have completed financial literacy training. This component of the ELA programme is the most recent, but also one of its most popular, with attendance registers showing that club attendance rebounds after microfinance is introduced (Yam 2013). Limited access to financial services and limited and irregular incomes mean that young women face great difficulties accumulating start-up capital. Only nine percent of young Ugandans (15-30), for example, have loans, with young women half as likely to have borrowed money as young men (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Loans, which start at the local equivalent of around US$100, increase by around US$60 with each cycle (Yam 2013), allowing members to access greater sums once they have proven their ability to invest and manage funds well. While some members express dissatisfaction with the size of new and repeat loans in both countries (Yam 2013), loan ceilings minimise the likelihood of encountering repayment problems or over-indebtedness.

Programme impacts: Social and Economic Empowerment for Young Women?

Since programme inception the ELA programme in Uganda and Tanzania has been subject to a rigorous multi-stage impact evaluation through a randomised control trial tracking 4,800 girls in 100

---

14 In two regions of Tanzania, for example, 27 and 28 percent of members received livelihood training in 2012, representing 63 and 74 percent of all out of school club members (Yam 2013). In Uganda, 10 percent of all club members had received training, corresponding with 20 percent of all out-of-school members (Yam 2013). Bandiera et al (2012) explore whether this targeting has any influence on school-going members in terms of encouraging school dropout. Reassuringly, they find no significant impact of the programme on school dropout among ELA members (Bandiera et al 2012).

15 Training in agriculture and poultry were accompanied by start-up materials to make use of training. Girls attending poultry training are given seven to 10 chicks, and those attending agriculture training are given one or two 10kg bags of maize seeds.
treatment and 50 control villages. After a baseline survey in 2008, Uganda’s first follow-up survey was conducted in 2010, the results of which are presented by Bandiera et al (2012). The evaluation in Tanzania started slightly later in 2009, with a first-round follow up in 2011. The results of this analysis are not yet available, but early analysis of the descriptive statistics in Tanzania suggests that it has had negligible impact (Yam 2013). In contrast, Ugandan results show that the ELA programme has achieved significant impact along social and economic indicators (Bandiera et al 2012). A greater number of young women in ELA villages are engaged in IGAs and earning higher incomes, health knowledge has improved across a number of areas, and crucially, this is feeding into behavioural change, reducing risky sexual behaviours and improving health outcomes among young women (Bandiera et al 2012). Table 2 illustrates a selection of some of the key economic and health-related indicators of change. It is important to note that the first-round follow-up took place prior to the introduction of microfinance. Economic improvements, therefore, can only be considered in relation to livelihood and financial literacy training and the programme’s social components.

Table 2. Impact Evaluation of the ELA programme in Uganda, selected indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income-generating activities (IGAs)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Engagement in IGAs</td>
<td>- 32 percent increase in girls engaged in IGAs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash incomes</td>
<td>- Girls are four percentage points more likely to earn income from self-employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Average increase of 14.8% in earnings from self-employment relative to baseline</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health-related behavioural change</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fertility rates</td>
<td>- Treatment villages display a 26 percent drop in fertility rates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-reported condom usage</td>
<td>- Treatment villages display a 12.5 percent increase in sexually-active young women who always use a condom.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual coercion</td>
<td>- Number of girls who report having sex unwillingly decreases by 16.1 percentage points in treated communities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: adapted from Bandiera et al 2012

One of the most visible improvements is in the number of girls involved in any form of IGA. The likelihood of a young woman being involved in an income-generating activity (predominantly self-employment) showed an increase of 32 percent over baseline levels (Bandiera et al 2012). Improvements in economic empowerment are evident across a variety of indicators, including engagement in income-generating activities, personal income, financial literacy, entrepreneurial ability, financial market participation and personal savings. Figure 1 illustrates that the programme significantly increases self-reported entrepreneurial skills along nearly every dimension of an

---

16 This is being carried out by BRAC in collaboration with a team of researchers led by University of College London and London School of Economics.
17 Second-round follow ups were conducted in 2012 and 2013 in Uganda and Tanzania, respectively. Results are in the final stage of analysis and will be available soon.
18 Encouragingly, there is no evidence that this influences negatively on school enrolment, suggesting that there is little trade-off in promoting the empowerment of girls through health and vocational skills-based interventions and their current incentives to invest in human capital (Bandiera et al 2012).
entrepreneurial skills index. The authors report that these impacts are particularly encouraging since RCT evaluations of standalone financial and entrepreneurship training have generally found weaker impacts. (Bandiera et al 2012). As Figure 2 illustrates, however, the results suggest that economic improvements are confined to ELA club members and do not spill-over to other young women in ELA villages (YEN 2013). Non-participants in ELA villages are not significantly more likely to be engaged in IGAs than young women in control villages (YEN 2013).

Figure 1. The impact of the ELA programme on entrepreneurship measures

Notes: The control variables include the adolescent age and a series of indicator variables for branch areas. The adolescents were asked to rank their ability on how well they can do the following activities on a scale of 1 to 10, 1 means they cannot do this activity and 10 is they definitely can (clockwise, beginning with the spoke on top): “Run your own business”, “Identify business opportunities to start up new business”, “Obtain credit to start up new business or expand existing business”, “Save in order to invest in future business opportunities”, “Make sure that your employees get the work done properly”, “Manage financial accounts”, “Bargain to obtain cheap prices when you are buying anything for business (inputs)”, “Bargain to obtain high prices when you are selling anything for business (outputs)”, and “Protect your business assets from harm by others”, “Collecting the money someone owes you”.

(Source Bandiera et al 2012)
Unlike the economic improvements which were confined to programme members, the evaluation finds significant improvements in reproductive health knowledge and practices that spill-over to other young women in ELA communities (YEN 2009). This means that girls are not only more aware and knowledgeable about issues such as STI’s, HIV/AIDS and early pregnancy, but are also more likely to follow safe practices (Bandiera et al 2012). As Figure 3 illustrates below, 16 percent more girls in treatment villages report always using a condom during sexual intercourse, and this effect is even stronger among ELA members. Similar direct and indirect impacts are observed in the prevalence of early motherhood. Girls living in ELA villages are three percentage points less likely to report having a child, corresponding with a 28.6 percent decrease in fertility rates among the target population (Bandiera et al 2012). Another startling result is the reduction in the number of girls reporting having had sex unwillingly, which dropped by around 16 percentage points: from the baseline level of 21 percent this represents a 76 percent reduction in such incidents (Bandiera et al 2012).

How have these impacts been achieved? There are two questions here, one that looks at how the impact is achieved among ELA members, and one which asks how its effect spread to their peers.
outside the club. As we discussed earlier in this section, we must consider the programme’s investment in and members’ subsequent exposure to life skills training. But we must also look beyond this to consider the strength of friendships and support networks that grow within and beyond the club. Life skills lessons are not limited to training sessions facilitated by club mentors. Every time young women meet at the club is an opportunity to share problems and discuss solutions, drawing upon the life skills and knowledge they have learned as well as on each other’s experiences.

Other indirect impacts of participation in ELA activities are also likely to play a role in improved health-related behaviours, namely increases in self-confidence and self-esteem, increased hopes and aspirations for the future, and greater economic security that gives young women the opportunity to enter relationships out of choice rather than necessity, giving them greater autonomy and negotiating power over the terms of sexual relationships. Common in discussions with ELA members in Uganda is a heightened determination to forge their own paths away from the manipulations and dangers of men. As one programme beneficiary in Uganda revealed, “Of course I get advances like all other young women here, but I just turn them away. Both younger and older women are constantly complaining about their boyfriends and husbands mistreating them, so why would I want to put myself through this?” (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). That social improvements have reached outside club boundaries is likely in part due to the fact that young people’s social networks are not confined to the club and that new social norms may start being established as ELA mentors start being seen as role models in the community. Furthermore, the programme has taken steps to catalyse this spillover effect, with ELA members in both countries taking peer education outside of club members to reach more young women in the community through networks of friends and through drama performances invoking key messages learned (Yam 2013).

We see, therefore, that the ELA programme in Uganda has achieved remarkable success in its early stages, even prior to the introduction of microfinance. Yet as we saw earlier in this section, tentative results from Tanzania’s impact evaluation do not show the same level of success. Cultural differences in terms of willingness to discuss personal issues undoubtedly influence the ability of members to draw upon each other for support and discuss potential resolutions to personal issues. These are exacerbated in the region where the programme struggled to secure clubhouses, with clubs here unable to build the levels of social cohesion and strong relationships displayed elsewhere given the lack of active participation in club activities (Yam 2013).

Different outcomes across Uganda and Tanzania also highlight the importance of strong programme management, implementation and two-way processes of accountability. Geographic difficulties made this difficult in Tanzania. The region where ELA clubs were struggling was 450km away from BRAC’s Head Office, making communication with programme management difficult and dampening accountability processes, both in terms of ensuring staff are implementing the programme in line with the model and that the demands of ELA members are fed back to programme management (Yam 2013). These problems were exacerbated by the fact that the post of Area Manager for the programme had been vacant for one year in this area, leaving supervisory staff stretched (Yam 2013). Underperforming staff – who were often absent from work and were not adhering to guidelines – feed directly into the motivations of mentors, and through them, ELA members (Yam 2013). In Uganda, by contrast, one-day monthly management meetings provide an opportunity for ELA staff from across the country to be updated with management and operational requirements, review programme rules and procedures to ensure adherence to these, and to feedback any issues from the field (Yam 2013). Staff are motivated, engaged and visiting the clubs frequently to supervise and to see whether the programme continues to meet the needs of its members (Yam 2013).
5. Conclusions and Lessons learned

As we have seen, risky sexual behaviours and poor sexual and reproductive health outcomes are symptomatic of a much broader set of constraints and challenges facing young people in all aspects of their lives. Central to this is limited financial independence and the difficulties young women face meeting their basic needs in a context of scarce economic opportunities. The ELA programme recognises that changing these behaviours requires building and expanding economic opportunities for young women, as well as creating an enabling environment in which the benefits can be realised through a supportive peer network which allows young women to be the change agents in their own lives and communities. In doing so the programme triggers a process of institutional change, creating a more supportive environment for youth by slowly reshaping the institutions that play a key role (and often a key constraint) in their lives. Given the widespread negative stereotypes of young people, attitude changes across parents, communities, employers, politicians and young people themselves help to create more supportive environments: not only in financial and material support, but also the emotional support necessary to give young women the necessary range and depth of assets that will help them to turn their dreams into reality and negotiate a successful transition to adulthood.

BRAC’s ELA programme illustrates the returns to this two-pronged approach to youth development, which increases young women’s access to the different forms of assets and resources they need at the same time as improving the institutional environment in which they are situated. Only through this the creation of a more supportive environment for youth is it possible to see positive youth development on a scale commensurate with large youth populations (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). Positive impacts from Uganda’s impact evaluation suggest that combining social and economic objectives and interventions prove especially effective when it comes to reducing risky sexual behaviours (Bandiera et al 2012). In doing so the ELA programme is recognising both the symptoms and root causes of young women’s engagement in risky sexual behaviours. These behaviours cannot be viewed separately from the limited economic opportunities, poverty and a lack of financial independence that increase young women’s vulnerability.

BRAC’s ELA programme above all seeks development as transformation: not only of individual lives and outcomes, but also of the social and economic environment which disadvantages and constraints young women in both contexts. The programme’s success in Uganda – and lessons from Tanzania where it has been less successful – has important implications for other programmes that aim to assist young people’s development, which we conclude with here.

Programmes must take a holistic approach to young women’s development: Making a successful transition to adulthood as healthy, happy and productive citizens requires young people to be able to take control of their own lives and futures. Programmes focusing on narrower outcomes (such as awareness campaigns or vocational training) are not addressing the multitude of constraints young women face that include; a lack of institutional support and social assets; a lack of role models in the community to aspire to; a lack of economic opportunities, poverty and financial insecurity; and limited means through which they can escape the realities and responsibilities of everyday lives, amongst others. All of these intertwine and conspire to dampen hopes and aspirations, stifle self-esteem and confidence, and feed into risky behaviours as survival strategy and means of escapism. The ELA programme may seek economic empowerment and better SRH outcomes, but it is evident from discussions with any ELA members in Uganda that these are outcomes of the programme’s ultimate goals of a holistic empowerment that enables young women to become change agents in their lives and communities. These would not be possible from the economic or social components individually.
Securing and retaining member participation and commitment is critical: Parents and members are attracted to the club primarily for its economic components since these meet their most urgent needs. Yam (2013) finds a much lower demand for participation in social interventions across both countries. BRAC’s graduated approach – which delays economic components until the social intervention is completed, is therefore critical to meeting the broader goals of the programme, namely the wider social benefits of improved knowledge and behavioural change as well as the individual benefits in terms of enhanced incomes, confidence, self-esteem and health-related knowledge and behaviours. Continued investments in and diversification of club activities is necessary for maintaining membership, participation, and social impacts. If girls get bored or if parents and/or guardians see club activities as a waste of time, they may become demotivated and stop participating as it becomes more difficult to make the time sacrifice of daily afternoon activities when other priorities prevail. Uganda’s ability to meet demands for new activities through tournaments and handicraft production, amongst others, must therefore be maintained.

What about young men? The ELA programme focuses on young women because of their relative disadvantage and their high risk to early pregnancy, school dropout, and exposure to sexually-transmitted diseases and HIV/AIDS. Yet pressure and influence from young men continues to be a key driver of the vulnerabilities of young women when it comes to their SRH outcomes. Under- and unemployment leads to specific forms of anxiety for young men when it comes to marriage and family formation, who are expected to be financially responsible for providing housing and living costs when they struggle in the present to meet their own basic needs (Banks and Sulaiman 2012). This can lead them to pursue multiple sexual relationships in an attempt to redefine their masculinity, which in turn increases young women’s exposure to STDs and HIV/AIDS (Joshi 2011). Unless young men work alongside young women to challenge unequal relationships, progress in reducing gender inequalities will continue to be slow (Plan International 2011).

Ongoing learning and evaluation leads to innovation: Research and evaluation has been core to BRAC’s philosophy since its inception, feeding back into programme design to ensure that it is suited to the realities and core needs of beneficiaries’ lives. Given the centrality of young people’s development outcomes in African (as well as to its programme portfolio), BRAC has made young people’s lives a core pillar of its research portfolio in East Africa. In 2012 this included the first in a series of reports on young people’s social and economic lives in Uganda. A nationally-representative survey combined with multiple qualitative methods provided an in-depth understanding of the realities of young people’s lives across the country and on how the scale and dimensions of disadvantage differs across regions, rural-urban locations and gender (See Banks and Sulaiman 2012). As well as its formative research, BRAC invests heavily in rigorous impact evaluations to track programme impact and help programme management to identify unmet needs. A number of complementary pilot programmes have been implemented as a result of on-the-ground learning and research and evaluation work, including the appointment of Adolescent Health Promoters in ELA villages and the initiation of including young men in their programme portfolio, primarily through vocational training.


Yam, V., 2013, ‘One design producing different outcomes: Comparative analysis of BRAC’s ELA programme in Tanzania and Uganda’, Kampala: BRAC Research and Evaluation Unit, mimeo.